

**RESPONSE SHEET**

**TO:** Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary

**FROM:** Commissioner Hanson

**SUBJECT:** **SECY-18-0106: Consideration in the Rulemaking Process of Issue Raised in Petition for Rulemaking on Applicability of Risk-Informed Categorization and Treatment of Structures, Systems, and Components for Nuclear Power Reactors (PRM-50-110; NRC-2015-0028)**

**Approved  X  Disapproved \_\_\_ Abstain \_\_\_ Not Participating \_\_\_**

**Comments: Below  X  Attached \_\_\_ None \_\_\_**

The current provisions in 10 CFR 50.69, "Risk-informed categorization and treatment of structures, systems and components [SSCs] for nuclear power reactors," do not allow combined license (COL) holders under 10 CFR Part 52 to voluntarily request NRC approval to implement risk-informed classification of SSCs in accordance with the safety significance of the functions they perform. The petitioner proposes to amend section 50.69 to allow COL holders to use the voluntary provisions of this regulation. I agree with the staff that the issue raised by the petitioner should be considered.

In option 2, the staff proposes to address the issue raised by the petitioner in the broader rulemaking approved by the Commission in SRM-SECY-15-0002 to improve alignment of Part 50 and Part 52 requirements. The staff recommends option 2 as the most resource efficient. While I approve the staff's recommendation, I note it is unfortunate that a relatively simple alignment on the rule applicability will take years to accomplish. I encourage the staff to place appropriate priority on matters such as these that support risk-informed regulatory approaches, consistent with the Commission policy on the use of probabilistic risk assessment and the agency's focus on risk-informed decision making.

I also approve publication of the Federal Register Notice and issuance of the letter informing the petitioner of this action, subject to the attached edits.

**Entered in STARS**

**Yes  x**

**No \_\_\_\_\_**

\_\_\_\_\_  
**SIGNATURE**

August 26, 2020

\_\_\_\_\_  
**DATE**

**NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION**

**10 CFR Part 50**

**RIN 3150-AI66**

**[Docket No. PRM-50-110; NRC-2015-0028; NRC-2009-0196]**

**Risk-Informed Categorization and Treatment of Structures, Systems, and  
Components for Nuclear Power Reactors**

**AGENCY:** Nuclear Regulatory Commission.

**ACTION:** Petition for rulemaking; consideration in the rulemaking process.

**SUMMARY:** The U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) will consider, within the scope of a Commission-directed rulemaking (Incorporation of Lessons Learned From New Reactor Licensing Process (Parts 50 and 52 Licensing Process Alignment)), the issue raised in a petition for rulemaking (PRM) submitted by Michael D. Tschiltz, on behalf of the Nuclear Energy Institute (NEI), dated January 15, 2015. The petitioner requested that the NRC amend its regulations to clarify and extend the applicability of its regulations related to risk-informed categorization and treatment of structures, systems, and components (SSCs) for nuclear power reactors. The petition was docketed by the NRC on February 6, 2015, and was assigned Docket No. PRM-50-110. The NRC has determined that the PRM has merit and is appropriate for consideration in the rulemaking process.

**DATES:** The docket for the petition for rulemaking, PRM-50-110, is closed on **[INSERT DATE OF PUBLICATION IN THE *FEDERAL REGISTER*]**.

**ADDRESSES:** Please refer to Docket IDs NRC-2015-0028 and NRC-2009-0196 when contacting the NRC about the availability of information for this petition. You may obtain publicly-available information related to this action by any of the following methods:

- **Federal Rulemaking Web Site:** Go to <http://www.regulations.gov> and search for Docket IDs NRC-2015-0028 and NRC-2009-0196. Address questions about NRC dockets to Carol Gallagher; telephone: 301-415-3463; e-mail: [Carol.Gallagher@nrc.gov](mailto:Carol.Gallagher@nrc.gov). For technical questions, contact the individual listed in the FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT section of this document.

- **The NRC's Agencywide Documents Access and Management System (ADAMS):** You may obtain publicly-available documents online in the ADAMS Public Document collection at <http://www.nrc.gov/reading-rm/adams.html>. For problems with ADAMS, please contact the NRC's Public Document Room (PDR) reference staff at 1-800-397-4209, 301-415-4737, or by e-mail to [pdr.resource@nrc.gov](mailto:pdr.resource@nrc.gov). For the convenience of the reader, instructions about obtaining materials referenced in this document are provided in the "Availability of Documents" section.

- **The NRC's PDR:** You may examine and purchase copies of public documents at the NRC's PDR, O1-F21, One White Flint North, 11555 Rockville Pike, Rockville, Maryland 20852.

**FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT:** Andrew Carrera, Office of Nuclear Material Safety and Safeguards; U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington, DC 20555-0001; telephone: 301-415-1078; e-mail: [Andrew.Carrera@nrc.gov](mailto:Andrew.Carrera@nrc.gov).

**SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION:**

## I. The Petition

The NRC received and docketed a PRM<sup>1</sup> dated January 15, 2015, submitted by Michael D. Tschiltz, on behalf of NEI. On March 27, 2015, the NRC published a notice of docketing in the *Federal Register* (80 FR 16308). The NRC held a public meeting on September 16, 2015, to gain further understanding of the scope and bases for the PRM. The meeting summary<sup>2</sup> is available in ADAMS.

The petitioner asked the NRC to amend its regulations to clarify and extend the applicability of § 50.69 of Title 10 of the *Code of Federal Regulations* (10 CFR), "Risk-informed categorization and treatment of structures, systems and components (SSCs) for nuclear power reactors." The regulations in § 50.69 allow nuclear power plant licensees and certain applicants to seek NRC approval to comply with the § 50.69 requirements as an alternative to compliance with the requirements for (Risk-Informed Safety Class) RISC-3 and RISC-4 SSCs listed in § 50.69(b)(1)(i)-(xi). Currently, the applicability provisions in § 50.69 allow holders of a license under 10 CFR parts 50, "Domestic Licensing of Production and Utilization Facilities," and 54, "Requirements for Renewal of Operating Licenses for Nuclear Power Plants," and ~~license-~~ certain applicants under 10 CFR parts 50 and 52, "Licenses, Certifications, and Approvals for Nuclear Power Plants," to voluntarily request the NRC's review and approval to implement the

---

<sup>1</sup> On February 25, 2014, Anthony Pietrangelo (~~petitioner~~), on behalf of NEI (~~petitioner~~), submitted a letter (ADAMS Accession No. ML14056A278) requesting that the NRC issue a direct final rulemaking to amend § 50.69, "Risk-informed categorization and treatment of structures, systems and components for nuclear power reactors," making it applicable to holders of ~~a~~-combined licenses (COLs). The NRC staff reviewed the petitioner's request and concluded that it did not meet the NRC's acceptance criteria in § 2.802(c) for a PRM because the request did not include a description of the petitioner's grounds for and interest in the requested action. On April 11, 2014, in accordance with § 2.802(c), the NRC offered the petitioner an opportunity to meet the NRC's petition acceptance criteria within 90 days. On January 15, 2015, Michael D. Tschiltz, on behalf of NEI, filed a PRM on the same topic, and included a description of the petitioner's grounds for and interest in the requested action. The NRC determined that the petition met the threshold sufficiency requirements for a petition for rulemaking under § 2.802, "Petition for rulemaking," and the petition was docketed as PRM-50-110.

<sup>2</sup>The meeting summary indicated that the NRC might issue a generic communication to clarify a misunderstanding of the reasons that COL holders were excluded from the § 50.69 provisions. The NRC will conduct rulemaking to determine if COL holders can use § 50.69; NRC will not issue a separate generic communication on this issue.

provisions in § 50.69. However, because the “applicability” provisions in § 50.69(b) do not include combined license (COL) holders under 10 CFR part 52, they cannot request the NRC’s review and approval to implement the provisions in § 50.69. The petitioner proposed a change to § 50.69 to allow COL holders to use the voluntary provisions of this regulation.

The petitioner asserted that preventing COL holders from using the provisions in § 50.69 is inappropriate and provided the following reasons in support of its position:

- A COL applicant that requests and receives NRC approval to implement the provisions in § 50.69 could later become a COL holder and, therefore, would no longer be allowed to use the previous approval.
- As written, the regulation denies applicability to plants possessing COLs for the life of the plant. A plant that currently holds a COL and that has been in operation for 15 years is in all practical matters no different than the current operating fleet, which, in accordance with the current rule language, can implement the provisions in § 50.69.
- Combined license holders must comply with the regulations in § 50.71(h)(1) and (2), which require COL holders to produce and maintain probabilistic risk assessments (PRAs) that ~~comport with~~meet the NRC-endorsed PRA consensus standards.

Therefore, ~~by operation of~~under the NRC’s existing rules, COL holders will possess the necessary PRA infrastructure to ~~effectively~~ implement the provisions in § 50.69 effectively. In particular, these plants will have developed Level 1 and Level 2 PRAs before fuel load. These PRAs will have covered those initiating events and modes for which NRC-endorsed consensus standards exist. Additionally, the NRC requires these plants to periodically (at least every 4 years) maintain and upgrade the PRA consistent with NRC-endorsed consensus standards until the permanent cessation of operations under § 52.110(a).

## II.Reasons for Consideration

The NRC agrees that the PRM has technical merit. The NRC will consider the issue raised in the PRM in its rulemaking process. The COL holders under 10 CFR part 52 currently cannot use the provisions in § 50.69 to risk-inform the categorization of SSCs and change the treatment of those SSCs.

The NRC did not receive public comment about the absence of an applicability provision in § 50.69 for COL holders in the 2003 proposed rule (68 FR 26511; May 16, 2003). The final provisions in § 50.69 issued on November 22, 2004 (69 FR 68008) retained this feature of the proposed rule. In 2007, the NRC issued a final rule to revise 10 CFR part 52 (72 FR 49352; August 28, 2007). The 2007 final rule left the applicability provisions unchanged; therefore, COL holders cannot request the NRC's review and approval to implement the provisions in § 50.69.

Upon further consideration, the NRC agrees with the petitioner that a nuclear power plant that currently holds a COL and that has ~~been in operation for 15 years~~sufficient operating experience is in all practical matters no different than the current operating fleet, which, in accordance with the current rule language, can implement the provisions in § 50.69. The NRC agrees that all COL holders that have developed a PRA in accordance with § 50.71(h) would possess the necessary PRA infrastructure to support an application for a license amendment to use the provisions in § 50.69.

In 2015, the Commission directed the staff to revise the regulations in 10 CFR part 50 for new power reactor applications so that they align with the requirements in 10 CFR part 52. In addition, the staff ~~is was~~ directed to revise the regulations in 10 CFR part 52 to reflect lessons

learned from recent new reactor licensing activities.<sup>3</sup> The goal of this rulemaking is to improve alignment between the licensing processes in 10 CFR part 50 and 10 CFR part 52, ensuring that the application of safety standards is consistent, regardless of the process used to license a new reactor, and reflect lessons learned from recent COL, design certification, and early site permit reviews and construction of new reactors licensed under 10 CFR part 52. The NRC ~~plans to begin~~began this rulemaking in fiscal year 2019.

The NRC will address the issue raised in PRM-50-110 in the “Incorporation of Lessons Learned ~~F~~from New Reactor Licensing Process” (Parts 50 and 52 Licensing Process Alignment) rulemaking.

### III. Availability of Documents

The documents identified in the following table are available to interested persons through one or more of the following methods, as indicated.

<b>DOCUMENT</b>	<b>ADAMS ACCESSION NO. / FEDERAL REGISTER CITATION</b>
Petition for Rulemaking to Amend 10 CFR 50.69, “Risk-Informed Categorization and Treatment of Structures, Systems and Components for Nuclear Power Reactors,” dated January 15, 2015.	ML15037A481
Notice of Docketing, “Applicability of Risk-Informed Categorization Regulation to Combined Licenses,” dated March 27, 2015.	80 FR 16308
Meeting Summary, “Discussion on the Petition for Rulemaking Related to 10 CFR 50.69, Risk-Informed Categorization and Treatment of Structures, Systems and Components for Nuclear Power Reactors,” dated September 25, 2015.	ML15268A353

<sup>3</sup> See SECY-15-0002, “Proposed Updates of Licensing Policies, Rules, and Guidance for Future New Reactor Applications,” dated January 8, 2015, and Staff Requirements Memorandum (SRM)-SECY-15-0002, “Proposed Updates of Licensing Policies, Rules, and Guidance for Future New Reactor Applications,” dated September 22, 2015.

Petition for Rulemaking, "Applicability of 10 CFR 50.69 to Holders of Combined Operating Licenses Under Part 52," dated February 25, 2014.	ML14056A278
Proposed Rule, "Risk-Informed Categorization and Treatment of Structures, Systems and Components for Nuclear Power Reactors; Proposed Rule," dated May 16, 2003.	68 FR 26511
Final Rule, "Risk-Informed Categorization and Treatment of Structures, Systems and Components for Nuclear Power Reactors; Final Rule," dated November 22, 2004.	69 FR 68008
Final Rule, "Licenses, Certifications, and Approvals for Nuclear Power Plants; Final Rule," dated August 28, 2007.	72 FR 49352
SECY-15-0002, "Proposed Updates of Licensing Policies, Rules, and Guidance for Future New Reactor Applications," dated January 8, 2015.	ML13281A382
SRM-SECY-15-0002, "Staff Requirements—SECY-15-0002—Proposed Updates of Licensing Policies, Rules, and Guidance for Future New Reactor Applications," dated September 22, 2015.	ML15266A023

#### IV. Conclusion

For the reasons cited in this document, the NRC will consider the issue raised in the PRM in ~~its an ongoing rulemaking process, as resources become available, although the petitioner's concerns may not be addressed exactly as the petitioner has requested.~~

The NRC tracks the status of PRMs on its Web site at <https://www.nrc.gov/about-nrc/regulatory/rulemaking/rules-petitions.html>. In addition, the Federal rulemaking Web site (<http://www.regulations.gov>) allows you to receive alerts when changes or additions occur in a docket folder. To subscribe: (1) navigate to the docket folder (NRC-2009-0196); (2) click the "E-mail Alert" link; and (3) enter your e-mail address and select how frequently you would like to receive e-mails (daily, weekly, or monthly). As in all rulemakings, the NRC will solicit and



consider public comments during the proposed rule phase of the rulemaking, before determining the approach that will become the basis for the final rule. Publication of this document in the *Federal Register* closes Docket ID NRC-2015-0028 for PRM-50-110.

Dated at Rockville, Maryland, this        day of        , 20~~2018~~.

For the Nuclear Regulatory Commission.

Annette L. Vietti-Cook,  
Secretary of the Commission

FEDERAL REGISTER NOTICE FOR PETITION FOR RULEMAKING ON APPLICABILITY OF RISK-INFORMED CATEGORIZATION AND TREATMENT OF STRUCTURES, SYSTEMS, AND COMPONENTS FOR NUCLEAR POWER REACTORS (PRM-50-110; NRC-2015-0028; NRC-2009-0196] **DATED**

**DISTRIBUTION:**

Public  
 DRM/RRPB R/F  
 RidsSecyCorrespondenceMCTR  
 RidsOpaMailResource  
 RidsOgcMailCenterResource  
 RisOcfoMailCenterResource  
 RidsOcaMailCenterResource  
 RidsNrrOdResource  
 RidsNroOdResource  
 RidsNmssOd Resource  
 PHolahan, NMSS  
 CBladey, NMSS  
 ACarrera, NMSS  
 MKhanna, NMSS  
 ABradford, NRO  
 JRankin, NRO  
 MLintz, NRO  
 GLappert, NMSS

**ADAMS Accession Nos.: Pkg - ML16229A101; FRN - ML16229A257 \*via email**

OFFICE	NMSS/DRM/RRPB/PM	NMSS/DRM/RRPB/RS	NMSS/DRM/RRPB/BC	NRO/DLSE/LB-3/BC*
<b>NAME</b>	ACarrera	GLappert	MKhanna	JColaccino (JRenkin for)
<b>DATE</b>	6/20/2018	6/20/2018	6/28/2018	6/25/2018
OFFICE	NMSS/DRM/D*	NRO/DLSE/AD*	OGC*	NMSS/DRM/RASB/BC
<b>NAME</b>	PHolahan (TClark for)	RTaylor (ABradford for)	TCampbell (ASilvia for)	CBladey
<b>DATE</b>	7/9/2018	8/20/2018	8/22/2018	8/31/2018
OFFICE	NRO/D	OEDO	SECY	
<b>NAME</b>	FBrown (VOrdaz for)	MDoane	AVietti-Cook	
<b>DATE</b>	9/13/18	9/ /18	9/ /18	

**OFFICIAL RECORD COPY**