

RESPONSE SHEET

TO: Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary
FROM: Chairman Allison M. Macfarlane
SUBJECT: COMSECY-14-0033: Public Release of Report, "A Preliminary Numerical Study of the Hazard from Local Landslide Tsunami Scenarios at the Diablo Canyon Site in Central California"

Approved X Disapproved _____ Abstain _____

Not Participating _____

COMMENTS: Below ___ Attached ___ None X



SIGNATURE

10/15/14

DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes X No _____

RESPONSE SHEET

TO: Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary

FROM: COMMISSIONER SVINICKI

SUBJECT: COMSECY-14-0033: Public Release of Report, "A Preliminary Numerical Study of the Hazard from Local Landslide Tsunami Scenarios at the Diablo Canyon Site in Central California"

Approved _____ Disapproved XX Abstain _____

Not Participating _____

COMMENTS: Below XX Attached _____ None _____

In 2006, the Commission directed that this report not be released, absent a thorough review, documented by the staff, and resolution of the staff comments by the report's originator. The Commission's direction is understandable, given that the report itself is labeled "preliminary" and the sponsor of this analysis at the Center for Nuclear Waste Regulatory Analysis (CNWRA) forwarded the analysis to NRC with the following description of its defects: "[T]he methodology is beyond state of the art, the uncertainties too large, and the results too speculative to be considered in current licensing decisions." CNWRA foresaw "no need to expend additional project resources to pursue detailed technical review of Dr. Sewell's work." Having not fulfilled the Commission's prior direction, and citing only to the passage of time, the staff now proposes to overturn the Commission's direction and release the preliminary study. In the absence of more, I find the staff's arguments unavailing.

If released, the report should be linked electronically to the CNWRA memo providing the report to the NRC (ML050450106) and the staff's subsequent memo (ML060460441). I further support Commissioner Ostendorff's proposal (as contained in an e-mail sent on his behalf on October 3, 2014) that a contextual, public communication should be offered by the NRC, such as a blog post or press release.



SIGNATURE

11/4/14

DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes No _____

RESPONSE SHEET

TO: Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary
FROM: COMMISSIONER OSTENDORFF
SUBJECT: COMSECY-14-0033: Public Release of Report, "A Preliminary Numerical Study of the Hazard from Local Landslide Tsunami Scenarios at the Diablo Canyon Site in Central California"

Approved XX Disapproved _____ Abstain _____

Not Participating _____

COMMENTS: Below _____ Attached _____ None XX

W. Ostendorff
SIGNATURE

10/15/14
DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes X No _____

RESPONSE SHEET

TO: Annette Vietti-Cook, Secretary
FROM: Commissioner Baran
SUBJECT: COMSECY-14-0033: Public Release of Report, "A Preliminary Numerical Study of the Hazard from Local Landslide Tsunami Scenarios at the Diablo Canyon Site in Central California"

Approved X Disapproved Abstain

Not Participating

COMMENTS: Below X Attached None

I agree with the NRC staff's recommendation to release the report entitled, "A Preliminary Numerical Study of the Hazard from Local Landslide Tsunami Scenarios at the Diablo Canyon Site in Central California." Given the passage of time and subsequent staff analysis of this issue, I see no reason to withhold the document from the public. Releasing the report, along with the staff's related analyses, will increase the transparency of the NRC's decision-making process.



SIGNATURE

10/16/14

DATE

Entered on "STARS" Yes ✓ No