

Failures of the SOARCA Draft Report Peach Bottom, Delta PA

2/22/2012

ADAMS ML12062A076

or

www.efmr.org/files/2012/SOARCA-2-22-2012.pdf

(Original high quality file)

Scott D. Portzline
Three Mile Island Alert
Security Consultant

Summary

1. The SOARCA conclusions as represented by the NRC Office of Public Relations are misleading.
2. The NRC has not clearly emphasized that SOARCA limited its simulations to a select group of scenarios.
3. SOARCA does not include many aspects of nuclear accidents which would severely alter the outcomes and conclusions.

Summary

4. The MELCOR software has numerous shortcomings and SOARCA should caution its readers that divergent results can easily be created.
5. The NRC has not attempted to correct these misconceptions in the media.
6. The NRC has a history of questionable or faulty probabilistic risk assessments.
7. There has never been a timely evacuation order at any of the world's nuclear accidents.

No Timely Evacuations

- There has never been a timely evacuation or a timely evacuation order issued at any of the world's nuclear accidents.
- 100% failure rate.
- The evacuation projections are purely wishful thinking...ignores known scientific data of real world nuclear evacuations.
- Therefore: SOARCA is not based on reality.
Three Mile Island – Windscale – Chernobyl - Fukushima



Real-World

None of these real-world nuclear accidents, prior to its occurrence, would have been predicted, or simulated by the MELCOR software utilized by SOARCA.



Plume Projections

- Many Emergency Operations Centers employ plume projection software programs which cannot calculate for multiple source term accidents.